**Document Pack** 



sirgar.llyw.cymru carmarthenshire.gov.wales

WEDNESDAY, 8 DECEMBER 2021

# TO: MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS PANEL

I HEREBY SUMMON YOU TO ATTEND A VIRTUAL MEETING OF THE MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS PANEL WHICH WILL BE HELD AT 10.00 AM, ON THURSDAY, 16TH DECEMBER, 2021 FOR THE TRANSACTION OF THE BUSINESS OUTLINED ON THE ATTACHED AGENDA

Wendy Walters

### CHIEF EXECUTIVE

PLEASE RECYCLE		
Democratic Officer:	Kevin Thomas	
Telephone (direct line):	01267 224027	
E-Mail:	kjthomas@carmarthenshire.gov.uk	

Wendy Walters Prif Weithredwr, Chief Executive, Neuadd y Sir, Caerfyrddin. SA31 1JP County Hall, Carmarthen. SA31 1JP

### MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS PANEL 3 OR 4 MEMBERS

#### EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT

1. Councillor H.A.L. Evans

#### **EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

1. Councillor G. Davies

#### LOCAL MEMBER(S) FOR THE APPELLANT LEARNER'S WARD

1.	Councillor	P. Hughes-Griffiths
2.	Councillor	K. Lloyd

#### NOTE:-

- 1. THE CHAIR OF THE MEMBERS APPEAL PANEL SHALL BE THE EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT (OR IN HIS OR HER ABSENCE THE EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION AND CHILDRENS SERVICES)
- 2. NO SUBSTITUTES ARE ALLOWED AT MEETINGS OF THE PANEL

### AGENDA

#### 1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

#### 2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

#### 3. MINUTES

- **3.1 18TH NOVEMBER, 2021 (10.00 A.M.)** 5 8
- **3.2 18TH NOVEMBER, 2021 (10.20 A.M.)** 9 10
- **3.3 18TH NOVEMBER, 2021 (10.30 A.M.)** 11 12
- **3.4 18TH NOVEMBER, 2021 (10.40 A.M.)** 13 14
- **3.5 18TH NOVEMBER, 2021 (10.50 A.M.)** 15 16

#### 4. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

THE REPORT RELATING TO THE FOLLOWING ITEM IS NOT FOR PUBLICATION AS IT CONTAINS EXEMPT INFORMATION AS DEFINED IN PARAGRAPH 12 OF PART 4 OF SCHEDULE 12A TO THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACT, 1972 AS AMENDED BY THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) (VARIATION) (WALES) ORDER 2007.

IF FOLLOWING THE APPLICATION OF THE PUBLIC INTEREST TEST THE PANEL RESOLVES PURSUANT TO THE ACT TO CONSIDER THIS ITEM IN PRIVATE, THE PUBLIC WILL BE EXCLUDED FROM THE MEETING DURING SUCH CONSIDERATION

#### 5. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT PS AGAINST A 17 - 42 DECISION BY OFFICERS FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT.

carmarthenshire.gov.wales

#### Members Home to School Transport Appeals Panel

#### Thursday, 18 November 2021

#### PRESENT: Councillor H.A.L. Evans (Chair)

#### **Councillors:**

G. Davies and K. Madge

#### The following Officers were in attendance:

R. Edgecombe, Legal Services Manager

A. Evans, Operations Manager - Passenger Transport

- S John, School Organisation & Admissions Manager
- S. Rees, Simultaneous Translator
- K. Evans, Assistant Democratic Services Officer
- E. Bryer, Democratic Services Officer

#### Virtual Meeting - 10.10 am - 10.25 am

#### 1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

There were no apologies for absence.

#### 2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no declarations of personal interest.

#### 3. MINUTES

3.1. 21ST OCTOBER, 2021 [10:00 A.M]

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held on 21st October 2021 (10:00a.m.) be signed as a correct record.

3.2. 21ST OCTOBER, 2021 [10:10 A.M]

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held on 21st October 2021 (10:10a.m.) be signed as a correct record.

#### 3.3. 21ST OCTOBER, 2021 [10:30 A.M]

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held on 21st October 2021 (10:30a.m.) be signed as a correct record.

#### 3.4. 21ST OCTOBER, 2021 [10:40 A.M]

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held on 21st October 2021 (10:40a.m.) be signed as a correct record.



#### 4. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED, pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007, that the public be excluded from the meeting during consideration of the following item as the report contained exempt information as defined in paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

5. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT M.D. AGAINST A DECISION BY OFFICERS FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT.

Following the application of the public interest test it was UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 4 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual. The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision-making process, however, on balance the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant M.D. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

RESOLVED, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, that the appeal be refused on the basis that M.D. was not attending the nearest or Local Education Authority designated school for the home address, due to parental preference.

6. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT K.D. AGAINST A DECISION BY OFFICERS FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT.

Following the application of the public interest test it was UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 4 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual. The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision-making process, however, on balance the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant K.D. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address and



therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, that the appeal be refused on the basis that K.D. was not attending the nearest or Local Education Authority designated school for the home address, due to parental preference.

CHAIR



#### Members Home to School Transport Appeals Panel

#### Thursday, 18 November 2021

PRESENT: Councillor H.A.L. Evans (Chair)

Councillors:

G. Davies and K. Davies

#### The following Officers were in attendance:

R. Edgecombe, Legal Services Manager

- A. Evans, Operations Manager Passenger Transport
- S John, School Organisation & Admissions Manager
- S. Rees, Simultaneous Translator
- K. Evans, Assistant Democratic Services Officer
- E. Bryer, Democratic Services Officer

#### Virtual Meeting - 10.25 - 10.35 am

#### 1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

There were no apologies for absence.

#### 2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no apologies for absence.

#### 3. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED, pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007, that the public be excluded from the meeting during consideration of the following item as the report contained exempt information as defined in paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

4. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT J.R.J. AGAINST A DECISION OF THE AUTHORITY FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT

Following the application of the public interest test it was UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 3 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual. The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision-making process, however, on balance the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant J.R.J. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home address



and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, that the appeal be refused on the basis that J.R.J. was not attending the nearest or Local Education Authority designated school for the home address, due to parental preference.

CHAIR



#### Members Home to School Transport Appeals Panel

#### Thursday, 18 November 2021

PRESENT: Councillor H.A.L. Evans (Chair)

#### **Councillor:**

G. Davies

#### The following Officers were in attendance:

R. Edgecombe, Legal Services Manager

- A. Evans, Operations Manager Passenger Transport
- S John, School Organisation & Admissions Manager
- S. Rees, Simultaneous Translator
- K. Evans, Assistant Democratic Services Officer
- E. Bryer, Democratic Services Officer

#### Virtual Meeting - 10.35 am - 10.40 am

#### 1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

An apology for absence was received from Councillor Gary Jones.

#### 2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no declarations of personal interest.

#### 3. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED, pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007, that the public be excluded from the meeting during consideration of the following item as the report contained exempt information as defined in paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

4. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT C.F. AGAINST A DECISION OF THE AUTHORITY FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT.

Following the application of the public interest test it was UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 3 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual. The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision-making process, however, on balance the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant C.F. free school transport to the nearest LEA designated school which was located within the statutory walking



distance and therefor, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED, in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, that the appeal be refused on the basis that C.F. was attending the nearest LEA designated school which was located within the statutory walking distance.

CHAIR



#### Members Home to School Transport Appeals Panel

#### Thursday, 18 November 2021

#### PRESENT: Councillor H.A.L. Evans (Chair)

#### **Councillors:**

G. Davies, E.M.J.G. Schiavone and A.D.T. Speake

#### The following Officers were in attendance:

R. Edgecombe, Legal Services Manager

A. Evans, Operations Manager - Passenger Transport

- S John, School Organisation & Admissions Manager
- S. Rees, Simultaneous Translator

K. Evans, Assistant Democratic Services Officer

E. Bryer, Democratic Services Officer

#### Virtual Meeting - 10.40 am - 11.00 am

#### 1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

There were no apologies for absence.

#### 2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no declarations of personal interest.

#### 3. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED, pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007, that the public be excluded from the meeting during consideration of the following item as the report contained exempt information as defined in paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

4. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT L.R. AGAINST A DECISION OF THE AUTHORITY FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT.

Following the application of the public interest test it was UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 3 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual. The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision-making process, however, on balance the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant L.R. free school transport to the nearest LEA designated school which was located within the statutory walking



distance and therefor, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

**RESOLVED** that the appeal submitted by L.R. for free home to school transport be upheld.

CHAIR



#### Members Home to School Transport Appeals Panel

#### Thursday, 18 November 2021

PRESENT: Councillor H.A.L. Evans (Chair)

Councillors:

G. Davies and C.A. Davies

#### The following Officers were in attendance:

R. Edgecombe, Legal Services Manager

- A. Evans, Operations Manager Passenger Transport
- S John, School Organisation & Admissions Manager
- S. Rees, Simultaneous Translator
- K. Evans, Assistant Democratic Services Officer
- E. Bryer, Democratic Services Officer

#### Virtual Meeting - 11.00 am - 11.10 am

#### 1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

There were no apologies for absence.

#### 2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no declarations of personal interest.

#### 3. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED, pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007, that the public be excluded from the meeting during consideration of the following item as the report contained exempt information as defined in paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

4. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT J.V. & C.V. AGAINST A DECISION OF THE AUTHORITY FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT.

Following the application of the public interest test it was UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 3 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual. The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision-making process, however, on balance the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant J.V and C.V. free school transport to a school which was not the nearest or LEA designated school for the home



address and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the individual circumstances of the case, together with the observations of the departmental officers.

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED that the appeal submitted by J.V and C.V. for free home to school transport be upheld.

CHAIR





By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted